

Research Paper

Analytical Criticism of Habbannakah al-Midani's View on Dating the Exception Verses of Surah al-Muzzammil

Soheila Jalali Kondori¹ , Zeinab Azadbakhti^{*2} 

¹ Associate Professor, Department of Quran and Hadith Sciences, Al-Zahra University, Tehran, Iran

² Ph.D. student in Quran and Hadith Sciences, Al-Zahra University (S), Tehran



10.22080/qhs.2025.5866

Received:

June 26, 2025

Accepted:

September 6, 2025

Available online:

November 12, 2025

Extended Abstract

1. Introduction

Exception verses are called Meccan verses in Madani surahs and Madani verses in Meccan surahs. One of the most important interpretations of revelation that specifically addresses the issue of dating the Quran is the commentary Ma'arij al-Tafqar wa al-Ta'qaq al-Tad'bur by Habbankah, which, in the contemporary era, has interpreted the Quran from a historical perspective and based on the date of revelation, and believes that there are verses of exceptions in 32 Meccan surahs and 3 Medinan surahs. However, a comparative examination of Habankeh's list of exception verses and her proposed table of the order

of revelation clearly indicates a methodological inconsistency. This inconsistency is manifested in the fact that he classifies a number of verses of the Meccan surah in a descending civil order table, but does not specify this distinction in the text of the surah's commentary; also, in some cases, sufficient interpretive evidence is not provided to support this position during the commentary. Habbannaka believes that Surah Al-Muzammil is not purely Meccan, and that its verses 10, 11, and 20 are Medinan and were subsequently added to the Surah. The following study, with an analytical-critical approach and a deep understanding of the interpretation of the stages of reflection and the details of contemplation, first explains the principles and

*Corresponding Author: Zeinab Azadbakhti

Address: Al-Zahra University (S), Tehran

Email: z.azadbakhti20@gmail.com

interpretative method of Habbannaka Al-Maydani regarding the exceptions of the Meccan Surah based on the order of revelation. In the following, this research will be devoted to a critical and meticulous evaluation of her view on the exceptions of the Quranic surahs, especially verses 10, 11, and 20 of Surah Al-Muzzammil.

2. Methods

The present study is qualitative and based on a descriptive-analytical approach. The data collection method is documentary (library). This includes a comprehensive study and review of written sources, specialized texts, and documents related to the research topic. The data collection technique was used to record, extract, and classify the required data. In the final stage, the collected data were analyzed, critically reviewed, and thoroughly evaluated.

3. Results

A critical analysis of Habankeh's view that verses 10, 11, and 20 of the Meccan Surah Al-Muzammil are Madani shows that this view is influenced by five axes: lack of attention to literary subtleties, ignoring content coherence, lack of attention to context, the existence of contradictions, and lack of accuracy in criticizing narrations in terms of historical reports.

In contrast, an examination of the textual evidence – including the surah's context and the correlation of its verses, along with the use of other interpretive sources – confirms the unity and structural integrity of Surah Al-Muzzammil. This evidence strongly suggests that the revelation of the verses in question (10, 11, and 20) occurred simultaneously with the rest of the surah and during the Meccan period. Therefore, Habbannaka's claim that the exceptions in Surah Al-Muzzammil are civil in nature is

not acceptable on structural and historical grounds.

4. Conclusion

Habbannaka considers some surahs to be completely Meccan, but in his table of the order of revelation, he presents a contrary view. Despite his emphasis on the complete Meccan nature of some surahs in the commentary (such as Surah Al-Mursalat), the table of the order of revelation presented by him classifies verse 48 of this same surah as Madani, which confirms a kind of internal contradiction in his classification system.

Habbannaka considers it wise to include a number of Meccan verses in a Medinan surah and Medinan verses in a Meccan surah, and believes that the wisdom of this is the intellectual-thematic and educational requirement. At that time, to account for the audience at the time of revelation when conveying religious rulings, or to provide teachings and educate a group of early believers and Muslims, it was sometimes necessary to delay the revelation of some verses until the Medinan period.

Textual studies show that Habbannaka's claim that verses 10, 11, and 20 of Surah Al-Muzzammil are Madani and exceptional cannot be accepted. The evidence in the context of verses 9, 10, and 11 indicates a deep content coherence between them. To support his view regarding the exceptions in Surah Muzzammil, Habbannaka has cited narrations that are inconsistent with historical reports and reliable rational and narrational criteria, and it seems that Habbannaka has introduced his personal taste into the interpretation and existence of the exception verses in Surah Muzzammil.

Funding

There is no funding support.

Authors' contribution

The responsibility for this article rests with the two research authors.

Conflict of interest

The authors declared no conflict of interest.

References

Holy Qur'an

- Ibn Ashur, Muhammad ibn Tahir, (1420), Al-Tahrir wa al-Tanvir, Beirut: Al-Arabi History Institute.
- Ibn Kathir of Damascus, Ismail ibn Amr, (1419), Tafsir al-Quran al-Azeem, Beirut: Dar al-Kutb al-Ilmiyah.
- Habbankah al-Midani, Abd al-Rahman Hassan, (1420), Ma'arij al-Tafqar wa ta'aqun al-Tadbu'r, Damascus: Dar al-Qalam, first edition.
- Habbankah al-Midani, Abd al-Rahman al-Hasan, (1425), Rules of Perfect Reflection on the Book of Allah Al-mighty, 3rd edition, Damascus: Dar al-Qalam.
- Khomehgar, Muhammad, (1393), Structural Interpretation of the Holy Quran, Qom: Ayah al-Nur.

Acknowledgments

Thanks to the editor and journal staff, for their efforts in bringing the article to fruition.

- Tabatabaei, Muhammad Hussein, (1417), Al-Mizan fi Tafsir al-Quran, Qom: Islamic Publications Office
- Tabarsi, Fazl bin Hasan, (1372), Majma al-Bayan fi Tafsir al-Qur'an, Tehran: Nasser Khosrow.
- Tabari, Muhammad bin Jarir, (1412), Jame al-Bayan fi Tafsir al-Qur'an, Beirut: Dar al-Marafa.
- Makki, Majd, (1425), the description of the book of Ma'araj al-Tafkar wa Minaqat al-Tadbar by Allamah Abd al-Rahman Habannake Al-Midani, Damascus, Dar al-Qalam.
- Marafet, Mohammad Hadi, (1415), Al-Tamhid fi Ulum al-Qur'an, Qom: Al-Nashar al-Islami Institute.